Tom L. Lewis
Mark M. Kovacich
Lewis, Slovak, & Kovacich, P.C.
P. O. Box 2325
Great Falls, MT 59403
(406) 761-5595

# IN THE UNITED STATES BANKRUPTCY COURT FOR THE DISTRICT OF DELAWARE

In re:

W.R. GRACE & CO., et al

Case No. 01-01139 (JKF)
Jointly Administered

Debtors.

Claim No. 00005563

# RESPONSE TO DEBTORS' FIFTEENTH OMNIBUS OBJECTION (SUBSTANTIVE) TO ASBESTOS PROPERTY DAMAGE CLAIMS

On behalf of claimant, Evelyn M. Carr (Claim No. 00005563), her attorneys, Tom L. Lewis and Mark M. Kovacich, of Lewis, Slovak & Kovacich, P.C., respond to Debtors' Fifteenth Omnibus Objection (Substantive) to Asbestos Property Damage Claims as follows:

- 1. Claimant can be contacted via her attorneys, Tom L. Lewis or Mark M. Kovacich, 725 Third Avenue North, Great Falls, Montana; telephone (406) 761-5595.
- 2. Claimant's claim is with respect to asbestos contamination from a Grace product in or on the property, to wit: asbestos-contaminated vermiculite from the W.R. Grace mine near Libby, Montana and/or from the W.R. Grace mining activities in and around the Libby community. Claimant's property is a residence located at 1681 Highway 2 South in Libby, Montana.
- 3. Claimant's claim is based upon the findings of the U.S. Environmental Protection Agency in its Administrative Record and supplement, test results, and other documentation, as RESPONSE TO DEBTORS' FIFTEENTH OMNIBUS OBJECTION (SUBSTANTIVE) TO ASBESTOS PROPERTY DAMAGE CLAIMS 1

well as information obtained from other sources.

- 4. Claimant consented to the production and release of supporting documentation in the possession of the U.S. Environmental Protection Agency to Grace and Grace's representatives at the time of submission of her property damage proof of claim in March 2003.
- 5. Claimant provided such supporting documentation, available from the U.S. Environmental Protection Agency's Libby office, to Grace and Grace's representatives as an attachment to her Response to Debtors' Second Omnibus Objection to Claims (Non-Substantive) filed on August 8, 2003.

# Claimant's Responses to Debtors' Specific Objections

C-1(d): Installation of Product, Knowledge of Asbestos in Product, Knowledge of Asbestos on Property, and/or Prior Asbestos-Related Lawsuits/Claims.

Grace indicates the claim form is deficient for failure to provide one or more pieces of information on a multitude of topics. Grace fails to identify with particularity which purported deficiency applies to claimant's claim. The burden of objection rests with Grace. Grace's generalized objection practice fails to sufficiently notify claimant of any respective objections. Further, Grace's objection presumes that written documentation exists. Claimant has made every effort to furnish all documentary information in claimant's possession to support the property damage claim. See the information previously provided as well as the Appendix for Claimants' Responses to Debtors' Fifteenth Omnibus Objection (Substantive) to Asbestos Property Damage Claims ("Appendix") attached to Response to Debtors' Fifteenth Omnibus Objection (Substantive) to Asbestos Property Damage Claims, Claim Number 00004712 (George James Bauer). Finally, the W.R. Grace & Co. Asbestos Property Damage Proof of Claim Form authorizes Grace, upon reasonable request, to obtain copies of any supporting documents from parties in possession of the same. As applied to claimant, Grace has made no such request.

In his proof of claim form, claimant stated that she did not install the asbestos-containing vermiculite found on her property and she does not have any documentation referencing the installation. Claimant has provided all relevant information in her possession regarding the asbestos-containing materials on the property.

#### C-2: Documentation Regarding Purchase, Installation, Presence, and/or Removal

Grace indicates the claim form is deficient for failure to provide one or more pieces of information on a multitude of topics. Grace fails to identify with particularity which purported deficiency applies to claimant's claim. The burden of objection rests with Grace. Grace's generalized objection practice fails to sufficiently notify claimant of any respective objections. Further, Grace's objection presumes that written documentation exists. Claimant has made every effort to furnish all documentary information in claimant's possession to support the property damage claim. See the information previously provided as well as the Appendix attached to the response to Grace's present objections in Claim Number 00004712 (George James Bauer). Finally, the W.R. Grace & Co. Asbestos Property Damage Proof of Claim Form authorizes Grace, upon reasonable request, to obtain copies of any supporting documents from parties in possession of the same. As applied to claimant, Grace has made no such request.

Claimant does not have any documentation addressing the installation or placement of asbestos-contaminated vermiculite upon her property. Claimant acknowledged this in the proof of claim form filed in March 2003. Claimant has provided copies of the documents received from the U.S. Environmental Protection Agency documenting the likely presence of asbestos-containing vermiculite on her property. See the information previously provided as well as the Appendix attached to the response to Grace's present objections in Claim Number 00004712 (George James Bauer).

/////

### C-3(e): Documents Regarding Product Identification

Grace's objection presumes that written documentation exists. Claimant has made every effort to furnish all documentary information in claimant's possession to support the property damage claim. Claimant has provided copies of the documents received from the U.S. Environmental Protection Agency documenting the likely presence of asbestos-contaminated vermiculite on her property. See the information previously provided as well as the Appendix attached to the response to Grace's present objections in Claim Number 00004712 (George James Bauer). Further, the W.R. Grace & Co. Asbestos Property Damage Proof of Claim Form authorizes Grace, upon reasonable request, to obtain copies of any supporting documents from parties in possession of the same. As applied to claimant, Grace has made no such request.

#### E-1: Sampling Reports

Claimant has provided all documents in her possession furnished by the U.S. Environmental Protection Agency pertaining to claimant's property. These documents, as well as the information provided in the Appendix attached to the response to Grace's present objections in Claim Number 00004712 (George James Bauer), confirm the existence of asbestos-contaminated vermiculite on her property and/or identify the hazardous propensities of asbestos-contaminated vermiculite. Grace's objection references damages subject to personal injury actions. Claimant's claim does not implicate personal injury damages. While claimant disputes Grace's claim that she "has not established that any health hazard exists," claimant need not establish the existence of a "health hazard" to prevail on a property damage claim.

Whether the "mere presence" of asbestos-contaminated vermiculite gives rise to personal injury damages is of no consequence. The presence of asbestos-contaminated vermiculite and/or other asbestos-contaminated materials has resulted in property damages as previously articulated. The damages include, but are not limited to, loss of use of claimant's property, the

Case 01-01139-AMC Doc 10393 Filed 10/22/05 Page 5 of 7

cost of restoration, and loss of value. The Court should not dismiss such claims based on the existence or absence of air sampling tests.

# G-2: Categorizing Claims

The proof of claim form was filled out to the best of claimant's ability. However, the "Claim Category" request in the proof of claim form is largely ambiguous with respect to the claimants from Libby, Montana. The Libby residents have suffered asbestos exposure from both asbestos-contaminated Grace products and Grace mining/milling/processing operations. Grace encouraged employees and residents of the Libby area to use asbestos-containing vermiculite in their gardens and homes. Additionally, Grace's mining/milling/processing activities subjected Libby properties to asbestos contamination in the form of particulate fall-out and otherwise.

Relevant documents confirm the existence of asbestos-contaminated vermiculite on claimant's property and/or identify the hazardous propensities of asbestos-contaminated vermiculite. See the information previously provided as well as the Appendix attached to the response to Grace's present objections in Claim Number 00004712 (George James Bauer). While some of the documents reference asbestos insulation, others suggest the property likely has additional asbestos contamination as well. Some, if not all, of this asbestos contamination stems from asbestos product, consistent with the "Claim Category" identified in claimant's proof of claim form. If the Court determines claimant has incorrectly classified the claim, claimant requests that the Court reclassify it accordingly. Note that Grace has urged the same resolution.

Grace does not identify claimant's property as one of the purportedly remediated properties. As that portion of the objection is inapplicable, it does not warrant a response.

/////

Case 01-01139-AMC Doc 10393 Filed 10/22/05 Page 6 of 7

Respectfully submitted this 200 day of October, 2005.

Lewis, Slovak & Kovacich, P.C.

By: \_\_\_\_\_\_ For Mark M. Kovacich P.O. Box 2325 Great Falls, MT 59403 (Attorneys for Claimant)

#### **CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE**

I hereby certify that a true and legible copy of the foregoing Response to Debtors' Fifteenth Omnibus Objection to Claims (Non-Substantive) was served on the day of October, 2005, by Federal Express courier, upon the following:

#### Co-Counsel for the Debtors:

Katherine Phillips Kirkland & Ellis, LLP 200 East Randolph Drive Chicago, IL 60601 fax 312-861-2200 David Carickhoff, Jr.
Pachulski, Stang, Ziehl, Young,
Jones & Weintraub, P.C.
919 North Market Street, Suite 1700
P. O. Box 8705
Wilmington, DE 19899-8705
fax 302-652-4400

### Counsel to the Official Committee of Unsecured Creditors:

Lewis Kruger Stroock & Stroock & Lavan 180 Maiden Lane New York, NY 10038-4982 fax 212-806-6006 Michael R. Lastowski Duane, Morris & Heckscher, LLP 1100 N. Market Street, Suite 1200 Wilmington, DE 19801-1246 fax 302-657-4901

# Counsel to the Official Committee of Property Damage Claimants:

Scott L. Baena Bilzin, Sumberg, Dunn, Baena, Price & Axelrod First Union Financial Center 200 Southy Biscayne Boulevard, Suite 2500 Miami, FL 33131 fax 305-374-7593

Michael B. Joseph Ferry & Joseph, P.A. 824 Market Street, Suite 904 P. O. Box 1351 Wilmington, DE 19899 fax 302-575-1714

RESPONSE TO DEBTORS' FIFTEENTH OMNIBUS OBJECTION (SUBSTANTIVE) TO ASBESTOS PROPERTY DAMAGE CLAIMS - 6

# Counsel to the Official Committee of Personal Injury Claimants:

Elihu Inselbuch Caplin & Drysdale 399 Park Avenue, 36<sup>th</sup> Floor New York, NY 10022 fax 212-644-6755 Marla Eskin Campbell & Levine, LLC 800 N. King Street, Suite 300 Wilmington, DE 19801 fax 302-426-9947

# Counsel to the Official Committee of Equity Holders:

Thomas M. Mayer Kramer, Levin, Naftalis & Frankel, LLP 919 Third Avenue New York, NY 10022 fax 212-715-8000

Teresa K.D. Currier Klett, Rooney, Lieber & Schorling 1000 West Street, Suite 1410 P. O. Box 1397 Wilmington, DE 19899-1397 fax 302-552-4220

# Counsel to the Future Claimants' Representative:

Richard W. Wyron Swidler, Berlin, Shereff, Friedman LLP 3000 K Street, NW, Suite 300 Washington, DC 20007 fax 202-424-7643 John C. Phillips, Jr.
Phillips, Goldman & Spence, P.A.
1200 North Broom Street
Wilmington, DE 19806
302-655-4210

#### Office of the United States Trustee:

Office of the United States Trustee Attention: David Klauder 844 N. King Street Wilmington, DE 19801 fax 302-573-6497

Tracus Porgeons